



Online article and related content
current as of September 1, 2009.

Speaking for the Dead: The Human Body in Biology and Medicine

Sabine Hildebrandt

JAMA. 2009;302(9):1007-1008 (doi:10.1001/jama.2009.1294)

<http://jama.ama-assn.org/cgi/content/full/302/9/1007>

Correction

[Contact me if this article is corrected.](#)

Citations

[Contact me when this article is cited.](#)

Topic collections

Medical Practice; Medical Education; Medical Ethics; Transplantation;
Transplantation, Other

[Contact me when new articles are published in these topic areas.](#)

Subscribe

<http://jama.com/subscribe>

Permissions

permissions@ama-assn.org

<http://pubs.ama-assn.org/misc/permissions.dtl>

Email Alerts

<http://jamaarchives.com/alerts>

Reprints/E-prints

reprints@ama-assn.org

variety of inflammatory and autoimmune disorders, with a tendency to include these under the umbrella of primary immunodeficiency disease. For example, this book includes a short chapter on autoinflammatory disorders such as familial Mediterranean fever; this area would be more appropriate in a book on infectious diseases, because these periodic fever syndromes are often initially misdiagnosed as infection. Before the category comprising primary immunodeficiency diseases becomes too wide, its boundaries will need to be defined, perhaps refocusing only on those patients prone to infection.

Authors from 30 university hospitals and international research centers have contributed to this book, which has a useful format for each chapter that incorporates a highlighted “Core Message” and clear diagrams and tables. An exceptionally useful introductory chapter explains the International Union of Immunological Societies classification of primary immunodeficiency diseases and provides information on the numbers of reported cases from different countries and the active patient registries generating these data. This will be informative for health planners.

A few color clinical photographs are included, but there has been no attempt, given the book's size, to provide an in-depth description of the many different complications associated with such a wide range of diseases. Clinicians searching for detailed advice in the clinical management of different primary immunodeficiency diseases will inevitably follow the many citations at the end of each chapter. There are a few instances in which the literature on clinical associations has been misinterpreted, but this is always a problem in the case of rare diseases for which an individual author's experience often relates to fewer than 50 patients; an example is the statement in a section on X-linked agammaglobulinemia, citing 1 case report, that up to 20% of patients develop a condition indistinguishable from rheumatoid arthritis, whereas this is not the experience in large clinics caring for patients with primary immunodeficiency diseases. One way to address this problem is to ask a panel of clinicians to comment on the clinical content of the chapters before the proof stage. However, a better overview should be obtainable as more clinical information comes in from patient registries.

It is inevitable in such a fast-moving field that some of the information is out of date before publication, but this book has captured most of the new data. Nevertheless, readers interested in particular genetic associations with primary immunodeficiency diseases will need to check the current literature, eg, the recent data changing the significance of TAC1 (transmembrane activator and calcium modulator and cyclophilin ligand interactor) genetic defects in common variable immunodeficiency.

Unfortunately, there are multiple and varied grammatical and spelling errors, but these could be easily addressed by better editing and proofreading in any subsequent edition. There is some repetition between chapters; for ex-

ample, a final chapter attempts to summarize treatment of primary immunodeficiency diseases, which has been covered in more detail in a preceding chapter. By being more selective, the number of chapter citations could be reduced. Accordingly, a future edition could be shortened, making it an even more attractive reference for busy clinicians.

Primary Immunodeficiency Diseases: Definition, Diagnosis, and Management is not suitable for all clinicians, but immunologists and specialist nurses managing the care of patients with primary immunodeficiency diseases should have this text on their shelves, as should general pediatric departments and hospital medical libraries. The book will likewise be of interest to scientists researching the immune system, because it provides a good overview of the critical genes for host defense in humans, which do not always parallel those in mice. Inevitably, this book will be compared to the similarly priced but more comprehensive book published by Oxford University Press mentioned above, but that competitor is not likely to be updated more frequently than every 7 years. Springer could fill a useful niche by publishing updated editions of this text about every 4 years.

A. D. B. Webster, MD, FRCP, FRCPath
Department of Immunology
University College Medical School
London, United Kingdom
adbwebster@btinternet.com

Financial Disclosures: None reported.

SPEAKING FOR THE DEAD: THE HUMAN BODY IN BIOLOGY AND MEDICINE

By D. Gareth Jones and Maja I. Whitaker
2nd ed, 296 pp, \$124.95
Farnham, UK, Ashgate Publishing, 2009
ISBN-13: 978-0-7546-7452-8

THE FIRST EDITION OF *SPEAKING FOR THE DEAD: CADAVERS IN Biology and Medicine*, by D. Gareth Jones, was published in 2000 and constituted a **milestone in the anatomical literature**. Here was someone who acknowledged the urgency of the ethical question surrounding the human body not only in life, but also in death; someone who formulated a complex of questions surrounding contemporary anatomical work and tried to answer them in a comprehensive fashion. Where do the bodies for dissection come from? Do they have an ethical significance? Do they have dignity? What can be done or not done with them? What has historically been done with them? In his first edition, Jones covered a wide area and suggested answers to many questions.

After 9 years, Jones and his new coauthor, Maja I. Whitaker, have undertaken a second edition. They saw the need to address new developments in the world of anatomy and biology, and in dispensing with the word “cadaver,” their new subtitle, *The Human Body in Biology and Medicine*, is

fitting for the scope of this second edition. The first edition focused not only on the use of deceased donors for anatomical study but also discussed, for example, the use of fetuses and of patients with brain death, and the second edition expands these chapters. The renaming also emphasizes Jones' concept of thinking of the deceased human body and the living human body as part of a continuum.

This edition is better organized than the previous and is thus more easily accessible; it also has been completely updated. The chapters, expanded in number from 7 to 9, have homogeneous titles that make their emphasis clearer. Each provides the background of the subject matter before developing the ethical questions and possible answers. Chapter 1, "The Dead Body," introduces the subject of anatomy and discusses its place within culture, providing a historical introduction and then discussing the ethical significance of the deceased donor. Chapter 2, "The Dissected Body," relates the history and legislation of body procurement and the contemporary use of bodies in teaching and clinical medicine. Chapter 3, "The Abused Body," deals with such diverse matters as teaching and research on clinically dead persons, the use of bodies in forensics, and the history of medicine and anatomy in the Third Reich, including a superb discussion of the diversity of ethical stances taken.

Chapter 4, "The Plastinated Body," provides the first comprehensive overview of the subject of plastination. It explains the plastination method, discusses plastination exhibits, and explores aesthetic and philosophical questions associated with them. However, while the controversy around Gunther von Hagens and his work is mentioned, the extent of the criticism, especially within Germany and concerning his procurement of bodies in China, is not completely related. Likewise, while historical forerunners of the plastination exhibits are cited, no mention is made of the popular anatomical exhibits of the 19th century, which

suggest that von Hagens' exhibits are not historically unique (for such mention, readers can refer to *A Traffic of Dead Bodies: Anatomy and Embodied Social Identity in Nineteenth-Century America*, by Michael Sappol [2002]). Nevertheless, this chapter is an excellent introduction to the manifold anatomical and ethical questions associated with the topic.

Chapter 5, "The Transplanted Body," provides a short history of the topic and then focuses on the various forms of consent for organ donation, thereby not skirting the issue of organ transplantation abuses in China. Chapter 6, "The Indigenous Body," relates the history, policies, and ethics surrounding the use of skeletal remains and develops guidelines for the contemporary study of such remains. Chapter 7, "The Developing Body," provides a short introduction to the complexities of the use of human embryos and stem cells and the ethical questions surrounding such use. Chapter 8, "The Thinking Body," deals with brain death and ethical questions surrounding neuroimaging. Chapter 9, "The Modified Body," discusses clinical approaches to modification and enhancement of the human body and their interwoven ethical implications.

Speaking for the Dead is a treasure trove for anatomists, anthropologists, and physicians of every discipline. The text will be informative and educational to anyone interested in matters of the human body and the ethical questions associated with it. The second edition has integrated new subjects like plastination and provides the reader with important introductions to complex problems.

Sabine Hildebrandt, MD
Division of Anatomical Sciences
University of Michigan Medical School
Ann Arbor
shilde@umich.edu

Financial Disclosures: None reported.